

MINUTES OF THE  
HIGHER EDUCATION APPROPRIATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE  
MONDAY, FEBRUARY 2, 2004, 2:00 P.M.  
Room 223, State Capitol Building

Members Present: Sen. David Gladwell, Co-Chair  
Rep. Bradley T. Johnson, Co-Chair  
Sen. Peter Knudson  
Sen. Ron Allen  
Rep. Margaret Dayton  
Rep. Brad Dee  
Rep. Kory M. Holdaway  
Rep. Gregory H. Hughes  
Rep. Patricia W. Jones  
Rep. Susan Lawrence  
Rep. LaWanna "Lou" Shurtliff  
Rep. Stephen H. Urquhart

Members Absent: Sen. Bill Hickman  
Rep. Katherine Bryson

Staff Present: Boyd A. Garriott, Senior Legislative Fiscal Analyst  
Debra Headden, Legislative Fiscal Analyst  
Rolayne Day, Secretary

Public Speakers	David Longanecker, Executive Director WICHE	Pres. Greg Fitch, UCAT
Present:	Commissioner Richard Kendall	Pres. Ann Millner, WSU
	JoAnn Lighty, UU Assoc. Dean for Academic Affairs	Pres. William Sederburg, UVSC
	John Frances, UU Dir. Of Undergraduate Studies	Regent George Mantes
	John E. Bennion, Employers' Education Coalition	Dr. Don Merrill, Assoc. VP, SLCC

A list of visitors and a copy of handouts are filed with the committee minutes.

Committee Co-Chair Johnson called the meeting to order at 2:20 p.m.

**MOTION:** Rep. Holdaway moved to approve minutes of the January 28, 2004, and January 29, 2004, meetings.

The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Gladwell and Reps. Jones and Lawrence absent for the vote.

1. Articulation and Barriers Restricting Credit Transfers Between Institutions—Analyst Boyd Garriott said the Legislature is concerned about transfer of college course credits from two-year schools to four-year state colleges and universities. Although there is no precise documentation about how many students this affects, there appears to be sufficient barriers restricting the transfer of credits to alert the Legislature. Students are required to take 60 credits for an Associate's Degree with about 36 of those credits in general education and the rest electives. Through Regent Policy R467, students are encouraged to determine a major early. The intention of the policy is that students who transfer to USHE state colleges and universities and have met lower division major requirements "will receive full value for the university required skills and content matter they have mastered." Course equivalency is to be "based on content and mastery of subject matter, and not just course level." Even though students are encouraged to take courses in a major at a two-year institution, when they get to the university, they sometimes find that a course has been disallowed. If a student has to retake only one three-hour class, it costs the state \$833 for the direct cost of instruction and the student pays at least an additional \$570 in tuition. Last year 1600 students transferred to other institutions in the state. If each of those students were required to retake one three-hour class, the cost to the state would be \$1.2 million in direct instruction costs. If these students were required to retake four classes (12 credit hours), it would cost the state about \$4.9 million, and students would also be required to pay additional tuition. For the most part, general education classes transfer fine, but there are problems in some of the other areas.

It is the recommendation of the Fiscal Analyst that this problem be thoroughly discussed and solutions be proposed. Mr. Garriott said there are excellent articulation agreements in some disciplines, but other areas do not have working agreements. In some cases, a course is accepted at one institution but not at another, and the system needs to be consistent. Sen. Allen said there are even barriers between different departments in the same institution. Rep. Holdaway said part of the discussion should include UCAT and concurrent enrollment and AP courses. Analyst Debra Headden said the ATE report on Page 9 of the ATE tab in the Budget Book discusses articulation among the various institutions. Rep. Shurtliff said course content for courses numbered the same should be standardized across the system. Mr. Garriott said rigor and standardization are also required to fully articulate. Rep. Johnson said he has the support of House leadership for his bill on articulation.

David Longanecker, Executive Director, WICHE, said a number of states have taken steps to decrease transfer barriers, and those that are succeeding have transfer policies in place. He noted, however, that there are far more credits lost because of the lack of articulation between high school graduation and college entrance. Transfer is a significant problem because more than half of college students attend more than one institution. There is some anxiety in senior institutions about community college students receiving credit for courses. WSU is doing well in the transfer area because they are competency based. Commissioner Kendell supports articulating the transition from public education to higher education, and the Regents are making efforts in that direction.

Rep. Johnson said the fiscal note for his bill is \$0 because it is more efficient if duplication is eliminated. Even though institutions are working on the problem, he feels there might be some savings if his bill is implemented. Both Rep. Shurtliff and Sen. Allen expressed support but feel it is a large task. Commissioner Kendell said articulation efforts are now directed at general education and pre-majors and will move to other areas when they are complete. If there is no fiscal note, the work is voluntary, and higher education will have to do what they can from year to year.

Sen. Gladwell assumed the committee chair.

Pres. Gregory Fitch said UCAT depends on a Board of Regents' formula to convert membership hours and competency to credit. Other requirements to ensure the transfer of degrees to another institution create even greater articulation problems. Legislation already exists ensuring credit, but there are problems on how to do it. If you try to make UCAT more traditional, it would take away from its mission.

Dr. JoAnn Lighty, UU Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, discussed the engineering articulation agreement between the University of Utah and other USHE institutions. Institutional representatives meet twice a year to coordinate not only engineering, but also math and science courses. Dr. Don Merrill, Associate Vice President, SLCC, said the meetings are voluntary, so they need commitment. Dr. Lighty said some problems occur because institutions don't teach all courses in a sequence, or the institution is smaller and they don't offer courses. Some distance courses have been offered to offset these problems. Dr. Merrill said some courses are numbered the same across the institutions, but there is a competency matrix showing which classes teach each competency at each institution. Dr. Merrill said it is also important who teaches the course because Master's Degree faculty are required for transfer. The articulation works because people in the field are pulling together to make students successful. Dr. Lighty said course syllabi are complete and easy to match competencies.

Mr. Garriott asked why marketing courses taught at SLCC are not accepted at the UU but are accepted at USU and WSU. Dr. John Frances, UU Director of Undergraduate Studies, said business schools meet together once a year and he believes it is fairly well articulated. The UU is pioneering a class to help transfer students and they have also opened a Transfer Center. The biggest problem is when students change majors, and the more students talk to an advisor, the smoother the transfer.

2. WICHE Executive Director David Longanecker—Mr. Loganecker made a presentation entitled, "What's Up in Higher Education in Utah and the West." WICHE provides information to help higher education make better decisions. It is comprised of 15 western states as well as North and South Dakota, Alaska and Hawaii. He discussed some of WICHE's services including direct program services, technical assistance, and policy analysis and information services.

Five areas are included in WICHE's work plan—finance, access, quality/innovation, workforce development, and accountability. California is developing a state accountability framework. Washington is updating a master plan

with focus on access and economic development. Nevada is planning for what they call “shared responsibility.” Colorado has decentralized their system of higher education. Oregon has given institutions a great deal of autonomy along with a greater amount of accountability. However, Oregon's Legislature didn't define accountability, and there are problems. Most states are simply staying the course. Sadly, performance funding is one of the first things to be eliminated in the current economy, and the institutions need to protect their base.

Dr. Longanecker feels Utah is behind the pipeline in workforce initiatives. He noted that if nurses stayed in the profession, we wouldn't have the nursing shortage today. Working conditions initiatives are a problem. A number of states are reviewing planning and accountability initiatives, but Utah is not doing any of these in a substantial way. Utah is one of the leaders in the nation in IT, however, with both enrollments and graduates growing. He noted that accreditation boards are a major factor in transfer difficulties.

Not much is happening in quality and innovation in student outcomes. South Dakota's value-added support for student learning tests students at the beginning and at the end of their education. Nevada's master plan calls for a similar plan to be implemented, and the federal government may add this to the federal program. Both Washington and California have deleted references to student learning, and this is a step backward.

Some states are improving the educational process and educational outcomes. California is developing an early assessment of college readiness with a high school exit exam that can also be used as a college entrance exam. Students take the test as juniors so they can use the senior year to make up any deficiencies. Another idea is to align high school graduation standards with college placement standards. Texas has a default high school college preparation curriculum resulting in less need for remedial education. Dr. Longanecker feels that all college sectors (including community colleges) should share placement standards, and that higher education should initiate alignment with K-12. When tuition is raised, financial aid should also be raised. Appropriations to institutions, tuition, and financial aid need to be coordinated.

Utah is doing well in many respects. A high percentage of students graduate from high school. However, Utah is growing rapidly and that growth will be a huge challenge. Utah's Associate and Baccalaureate degrees are well above the national average. Some states received increases and others received decreases in funding, but Utah held higher education harmless. There is not much State financial aid, so the most needy students are at risk. Relying on the federal government for financial aid is a poor idea because the current administration has other priorities.

Dr. Longanecker discussed the Colorado voucher system, a new way of financing higher education. It is radical, but he is supportive because of constitutional law in a taxpayers' bill of rights that limits expenditures. Utah is right in the middle with a huge challenge in growth, but a good set of policies and a sound base of higher education.

**MOTION:** Rep. Holdaway moved that at a future committee meeting, everyone should come prepared to give specific ways to increase needs-based financial aid for students of higher education.

Comments to the motion were heard from Sen. Gladwell and Dr. Lighty.

The motion was withdrawn.

3. John E. Bennion, Employer's Education Coalition (EEC)—Mr. Bennion said EEC findings call for a higher education strategic plan. The core mission of higher education needs to be defined in three areas: quality of life, enhancing culture and quality of life, and as an economic engine. The role of each institution needs to be defined in those three areas. Institutions try to spread their core because of a funding mechanism based on enrollment growth. The EEC recommends more program-based funding aligned with a strategic plan. There should be four segments to the USHE: (1) research 1 institutions who focus on economics and research; (2) broad access institution; (3) open entry/open exit institutions; and (4) technical education under UCAT. One reason for the articulation problems is economics because institutions can teach a lot of sections of lower divisions courses to raise FTE which in turn raises funding. Mr. Bennion also feels articulation with high schools is important. Given the current funding mechanism, the UU and USU have to chase enrollment, so he recommends funding them differently and strengthening admissions requirements. Mr. Bennion also feels this would help high schools be better at educating students in K-12. In the report, the EEC called on the Legislature to empower the Board of Regents to come up with an integrated strategy rather than trying to micromanage the institutions.

4. Role and Mission of Higher Education Including UCAT—Commissioner Kendell said the Board of Regents completed a master plan in 2000. He distributed a handout to the committee showing the roles and missions of each institution.. Higher education's portion of SB 154 was to articulate higher education with public education (Performance Plus). A fairly significant price tag on the bill has required higher education to pull back given the current economic situation. Higher education is working to improve articulation by creating competencies, first in math and writing. The project is not complete, but faculties from both public education and higher education are meeting to determine what the competencies are and how to tie the two systems together.

The Board of Regents is also working to address remedial education issues. As institutions have increased admissions requirements, the need for remediation has declined. The Commissioner's Office is working on a resolution with Rep. Dillree regarding remediation choices. Several proposals are on the table: USU could provide courses through Extension or Cooperative Education; there is a proposal to make remediation self-sustaining; and others—it is still a work in progress. The community colleges feel remedial work is core to their mission. State funding for remediation is \$3.5 to \$3.7 million a year; the remaining cost is made up by tuition. The Governor would like to make all remediation self-sustaining. Commissioner Kendell said community colleges have a fairly significant group of people, mainly adults coming back to school, who need refresher courses. Before making it completely self-sustaining, the needs of the students need to be studied.

Sen. Gladwell said a college-readiness curriculum like Texas could only happen in Utah if universities insisted that students take specific courses or they don't get in. Commissioner Kendell said the research institutions do that now. Everyone needs an education in our society whether they get it right after high school or later in life. Most people need a rigorous curriculum in high school to be successful in life. He noted, however, that public education held hearings on this subject, and the people pushed back saying it wasn't necessary.

Rep. Lawrence said we need to educate adults before we get to the kids. It looks like an institution's role and mission is defined, but as it grows, it keeps the same role and mission and just adds more. She asked for clarification on the types of role categories. Commissioner Kendell said roles and missions are nationally defined, but Utah can't afford a highly-segmented system. The State can only afford one type of institution in a community and as those institutions have grown, they have had to retain all they did before and then take on the next role as well. Rep. Lawrence asked if all institutions will eventually be listed under Type 1 or 2 and then UCAT. Commissioner Kendell said one problem is a tremendous population growth in Utah County, and a lot of public pressure from communities to grow an institution. Pres. William Sederburg, UVSC, said population growth creates pressure that leads to an increasing list of services. Pres. Ann Millner said WSU had the dual role of a community college and state college for several years and now they are a university. It is important to maintain the community college role as well as the university role and it is very efficient for the state to house it under one administration on one campus. Regent George Mantes said the Board of Regents is very cognizant of the problem and they will not let the system grow without a lot of oversight.

Rep. Lawrence said perhaps the roles shouldn't be so rigid as institutions expand to meet community demands. Commissioner Kendell said there needs to be a compelling need for an institution to change, and the state must be able to pay for the conversion. Commissioner Kendell said UCAT ought to be driven by employers to meet the demands of the economy, not by a credit system. There are over 500,000 courses in the USHE, so the potential for problems is pretty good. They are working to articulate the general education portion right now and will be able to report by October 2004 as required by FY 2004 intent language.

**MOTION:** Rep. Dee moved to adjourn.

Committee Co-Chair Gladwell adjourned the meeting at 4:55 p.m.

Minutes were reported by Rolayne Day, Secretary.